

## EPA Official Record

---

**Notes ID:** 3D70E81962FEF4E7852571AA00775B26

**From:** Jay Field <Jay.Field@noaa.gov>

**To:** Allison Hiltner/R10/USEPA/US@EPA

**Copy To:** Bruce Duncan/R10/USEPA/US@EPA; Burt Shephard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA; Charles Ordine/R10/USEPA/US@EPA; Lon Kissinger/R10/USEPA/US@EPA; Steinhoff.Marla@mailhub.epa.gov; Erika Hoffman/R10/USEPA/US@EPA

**Delivered Date:** 07/13/2006 02:44 PM PST

**Subject:** Re: Fw: updated water letter, and draft FWM comments

Allison,

In the comments I just sent, I forgot to include a paragraph on dietary scenarios in the FWM. We should request further discussion on the approach to developing the dietary scenarios for benthic invertebrates and juvenile fish. Because benthic invertebrates are the primary base for the foodweb model for all fish and crab species in the model, the information in the benthic invert box is critical to the FWM results. The benthic dietary scenario appears to be based on the benthic invertebrates collected during Phase 2 sampling. That would be fine if we were looking at infaunal benthic inverts as an endpoint on its own, but we are also using the same information to look at benthic invertebrate prey for fish and crabs. The problem with this is that the type of benthic inverts as prey varies considerably among species and may not be represented by the organisms collected in a grab sample. For example, shiner surfperch feed more on epibenthic prey, which have a much greater water exposure to their prey, while English sole feed more on infaunal inverts (more like what was sampled in the grabs).

Similarly, it is not clear to me what the "juvenile fish" are supposed to represent. Forage fish that serve as prey for higher trophic level organisms (fish, birds, mammals) are typically more likely feeding on epibenthic inverts and zooplankton than infaunal inverts.

Jay

Hiltner.Allison@epamail.epa.gov wrote:

> Just a very strong reminder that I need to finish up the FWM TM3  
> comments tomorrow, so please send me and Charlie edits to the comments  
> today. Remember they don't have to be detailed, as the strategy is to  
> form a committee to meet and to over the issues in detail. Thanks.  
>  
> Allison Hiltner

> EPA Region 10  
> phone: (206) 553-2140  
> fax: (206) 553-0124  
> hiltner.allison@epa.gov  
> ----- Forwarded by Allison Hiltner/R10/USEPA/US on 07/13/2006 08:28 AM  
> -----  
>  
> Allison  
> Hiltner/R10/USEP  
> A/US To  
> Bruce Duncan/R10/USEPA/US, Burt  
> 07/07/2006 03:03 Shephard/R10/USEPA/US, Charles  
> PM Ordine/R10/USEPA/US, Jay Field,  
> Lon Kissinger/R10/USEPA/US  
> cc  
> Sheila Eckman/R10/USEPA/US@EPA,  
> bhel461@ecy.wa.gov,  
> Steinhoff.Marla@mailhub.epa.gov@E  
> PA  
> Subject  
> updated water letter, and draft  
> FWM comments  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>  
> Ok, gang, we're getting closer. Here is the updated water sampling  
> letter which incorporates Sheila's, Charlie's and Jay's comments.  
> Bruce, thanks for calling Charlie - he has a much better feel for the  
> issues than he did based on my trying to explain it to him.  
>  
> I have also attached the draft comments I plan to send out on the FWM  
> tech memo #3, asking for formation of a technical committee to go over  
> several issues and providing more detail on the water issue. This is  
> just a reworking and editing of the e-mail Bruce sent to some of you  
> earlier this week. You'll see several notes in yellow where either  
> Bruce or I need more input/clarification.  
>  
> As far as I am concerned, the letter is ready to go, but Bruce and  
> Charlie should take a look at it one more time. I need to get it out

by  
> early next week.  
>  
> I'd like to get your comments on the comments by early next week -  
they  
> can go out after the letter, but I'd like to get them out by the end  
of  
> the week.  
>  
> Thanks, everyone, for your help.  
>  
> (See attached file: Water sampling letter.doc) (See attached file: FWM  
TM  
> 3 prelim comments.doc)  
>  
> Allison Hiltner  
> EPA Region 10  
> phone: (206) 553-2140  
> fax: (206) 553-0124  
> hiltner.allison@epa.gov  
--

---

Jay Field  
Coastal Protection and Restoration Division  
Office of Response and Restoration, NOAA  
7600 Sand Point Way NE  
Seattle, WA 98115-6349  
(P) 206-526-6404  
(F) 206-526-6865  
(E) jay.field@noaa.gov  
<http://response.restoration.noaa.gov/cpr/cpr.html>